

## CONTENTS

<b>Foreword</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Chapter 1: On the Order of the Mishnayot in Tractate Horayot</b>	<b>9</b>
The Sin of the Anointed Priest and the Congregation 9 • A Breakdown of the Conditions that Require a Congregational Sacrifice and Their Order in the First Chapter 11 • The Order of the Three Halakhot in Mishna 4 14 • The Order of the Conditions that Require Bringing a Congregational Sacrifice in the First Chapter and the Difficulties with It 21 • On the Order of the Halakhot in the Second Chapter 23 • The Repetition Regarding the Court and the Absence of the Status of the Anointed Priest in Mishnayot 4–5 According to the Standard Version 28 • The Difficulties in the Third Chapter 33 • The Order of the Halakhot in the Third Chapter 36 • “An Ending that is Like a Beginning” and Two “Students” in Their Order 38	
<b>Chapter 2: On the Order of the Halakhot in Tosefta Horayot</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Chapter 3: Towards the Elucidation of a Mishna in Tractate Horayot (1:1; 2a–3b)</b>	<b>46</b>
On the Meaning of the Idea “One Who Relies on Himself” 47 • The Explanation of the Final Section of the <i>Sugya</i> in 2b 49 • On the Explanation of the Final Section 51 • On the Explanation of the Variant <i>Baraitas</i> on the Final Section 55 • On the Suggestion of the <i>Sugya</i> 61 • The <i>Sugya</i> in 3b 64	
<b>Chapter 4: An Individual Who Acted on an Instruction of a <i>Bet Din</i> (2b–3a)</b>	<b>67</b>
The Difficulties in the <i>Sugya</i> 75 • The <i>Sugya</i> in 2a 84 • The Source of the Controversy Between Rav and R. Yohanan 87 • On the Meaning of Shmuel’s Sayings 89 • On the Suggestion of the Babylonian <i>Sugya</i> 92 • The <i>Sugya</i> in bShabbat 93a 95 • The <i>Sugya</i> in the Yerushalmi Horayot 1:1, 45d 97	

**Chapter 5: “The Court’s Decision Must Be Unanimous” (3b) 104**

The Meaning of the Condition “a Unanimous Ruling” 107 • The Improbability of the Question According to the Printed Version 107 • Suggestion of the Question According to the Ritva’s Version – and the Problem with It 109 • Did R. Mesharshia Raise an Objection? 111 • “Where They Are All Present, the Decision is Valid; But If Not, Their Decision Is Invalid” 112 • “Ten” or “Everyone” 113 • On the Suggestion of the *Sugya* 113

**Chapter 6: An Individual Who Acted on the Basis of a *Bet Din* Decision after They Rescinded the Decision (1:2; 3b–4a) 118**

The Difficulties in the Mishna in Our Version 120 • On the Significance of Rava’s Statement “The Difference Between Them Is the Case of One Who Started on a Journey” in the Babylonian Talmud and R. Bun Bar Hiya’s Statement “Standing Between Two Jurisdictions” in the Yerushalmi 124 • The Original Statements of R. Zera and R. Yose in the Babylonian Talmud 129 • On the Suggestion of the Mishna 132

**Chapter 7: The Uncertain Guilt Offering Is the Difference Between Them (3b–4a) 136**

The Explanation of R. Yohanan’s Statement According to the Commentators and Its Difficulty 139 • The Relationship Between R. Yohanan’s Statement to the Examples of R. Zera and R. Yose 144 • The *Sugya* in bGittin 73b–74a 146 • On the Significance of the Statement “The Uncertain Guilt Offering Is the Difference Between Them” in the *Sugya* in Gittin 152 • On the Significance of the Statement “The Uncertain Guilt Offering Is the Difference Between Them” in the *Sugya* in Horayot 154 • The Original Context of Symmachus ben Joseph’s Words 156

**Chapter 8: Annulling Part and Sustaining Part in Court Decisions (4a–b) 160**

Between Ula and Hizkiya’s Homilies and R. Ashi’s Homily 166 • On the Opinion of the *Baraita* in the Tosefta 169 • The Discussion in Shmuel’s Statement and Its Difficulty 175 • The Discussion in

R. Yosef's Problem and Its Difficulty 178 • On the Explanation of R. Yosef's Problem 181 • R. Zera's Problem and Its Different Versions 182

**Chapter 9: The Significance of the Directive to Uproot an Entire Principle in the Yerushalmi (1:3, 46a) 185**

The Difficulties in the *Sugya* 187 • Methods as Regarding Defining a Ruling that an Entire Principle Was to be Uprooted and a Ruling to Cancel Some and Uphold Some 188 • On the Significance of the Statements of Shmuel Bar Abba and R. Shmuel Bar R. Yizhak 191 • On the Significance of the Statement of R. Yose 192 • Result of the Clarification 193

**Chapter 10: *Mufla shel Bet Din* (4b) 195**

The Reason for the Law of “*Mufla*” in the Babylonian Talmud and the Meaning of “*Mufla*” According to the Commentaries 197 • The Reason for the Law of “*Mufla*” in the Sifra and the Meaning of “*Mufla*” 199 • The Difference Between the Condition of Everyone Being Present and the Erroneous Instruction of Everyone 201 • The Order of the “Bava”s in the Mishna and in the Sifra 202 • Tosefta Horayot 1:2 203 • The *Sugya* in 3b 205 • The *Baraita* “כי יפלא דבר” ... אם שמעו אמרו...” 207 • The *Baraita* “...במופלא שבב”ד הכתוב מדבר... ומן” 208 • The Midrash “לו אם לאו הוא ומופלא שבהם באין לבית דין... והאבן גדולה...” 209 • The Midrash “אל יחסר המזג...” 211

**Chapter 11: Types of Majority in Erroneous Court Decisions (5a–b) 213**

On the Significance of “Majority” in the Beginning of the *Sugya* 215 • Is “Or the Majority” Found in the Original? 216 • The Methods of R. Yehuda and R. Shimon According to the *Baraita* 222 • The Methods of the Tannaim According to the Yerushalmi 225 • The *Baraita* in Sifre and Its Difficulty 230 • The Progression of the *Baraita* in Sifre 233 • Result of the Clarification 234

<b>Chapter 12: On the Law of the Tribe that Acted on an Instruction of a <i>Bet Din</i> (5b)</b>	<b>236</b>
The Relationship Between the Problem and the Explanation of the Problem 240 • The Discussion in the <i>Baraita</i> “What Do They Bring...” and Its Difficulties 243 • On the Suggestion of the <i>Sugya</i> in the Babylonian Talmud 250	
<b>Chapter 13: Atonement for the Dead (5b–6a)</b>	<b>254</b>
The Sacrifices Brought by Diaspora Jews 259 • The Version of R. Papa’s Statement and Its Difficulty 259 • “How Does R. Papa Know This?” 260 • The Variant <i>Sugya</i> , Temura 15a–b 262 • On the Suggestions of the <i>Sugyot</i> 263	
<b>Chapter 14: On the Difference Between the Congregation and the Court in Ignorance of the Law (6a)</b>	<b>267</b>
The Explanation on the Identification of Rav and Its Difficulties 268 • The Explanation on the Identification of R. Yosef and Its Difficulties 271 • On the Suggestion of the <i>Sugya</i> 272	
<b>Chapter 15: On the Legal Status of the Day of Atonement Bull (Yoma 49b–50b; Horayot 6a)</b>	<b>276</b>
The Supporting Argument 279 • Rejection of the Supporting Argument 281 • Abaye’s Difficulty and Its Discussion 284 • On the Suggestion of the <i>Sugya</i> 286	
<b>Chapter 16: On the Definition of the Individual Offering and the Communal Offering (Temura 1:2; Yoma 50a; Horayot 3b)</b>	<b>290</b>
The Sources that Support R. Yehuda’s Position 294 • The Bull of the Day of Atonement 298 • The High Priest’s <i>Havitin</i> 300 • Pesah 301 • The Sacrifice Brought for a Mistaken Ruling and the Sacrificial Goat Brought for the Transgression of Idolatry 305 • Hagiga 311 • Conclusion 315	

**Chapter 17: Contradictory Interpretations of a *Baraita* in Two Talmudic Passages (6a–b)** 317

Horayot 6a–b 317 • Abaye’s Problem and Its Difficulty 320 • The Versions of R. Yosef’s Statement and Their Meanings 325 • The Question “נייתו פר בהוראה” 327 • The Question “And if so There Are More Than Twelve Tribes” 327 • On the Significance of R. Aha ben R. Yaakov’s Statement 328 • The Question “If so There are Fewer Than Twelve Tribes” and Its Discussion 330 • The Question “How Did It End?” and Its Answer 331 • On the Suggestion of the *Sugya* 332

**Chapter 18: The Ruling of the Anointed High Priest (6b–7a)** 339

The Relationship Between the *Peshita* Problem and Abaye’s Statement 342 • The Explanation of Abaye’s Statement 344 • The Difficulties in “Bava”’s 2 and 3 in the Beginning 346 • The Difficulties in the Explanations of the Commentaries on the Final Section 350 • On the Significance of the Final Section 352 • On the Meaning of the Halakha “עשו... על הוראת כהן משיח הייבין” 354 • Result of the Clarification 361

**Chapter 19: “He Whose Sin and Erroneous Act are Equal” (6b–7a)** 363

The Improbability of the Explanation of the *Sugya* 366 • On the Significance of the Homilies “He Whose Sin and Erroneous Act Are Equal” and “He Whose Sin Was Erroneous” 374

**Chapter 20: On the Meaning of “He Made the Decision Alone” and “He Made the Decision Together with the Congregation” (2:2; 7a–b)** 379

The Sections of the *Sugya* 383 • The Version of R. Papa’s Statement and Its Place in the *Sugya* 388 • The Difficulties of Abaye and Rava’s Explanation of the Mishna According to Our Version 389 • The Version that Is Reflected in the Method of the Rambam 395 • On the Significance of R. Papa’s Statement 397 • On the Significance of “He Made the Decision Together with the Congregation” 399 • They Made the Decision with Two Types of Fat or with Fat and Blood 404 • On the Suggestion of the *Sugya* 410

**Chapter 21: One Does Not Bring an Uncertain *Asham* on Positive and Negative Precepts in the Temple (2:4; 8b)** 413

The Commentaries on the Laws of an Uncertain *Asham* in the Mishna 415 • The Original Version of the Mishna 417 • On the Explanation of the *Sugya* on the Law of an Uncertain *Asham* in the Mishna 419 • The Original Version of R. Yizhak's Homily 430 • On the Suggestion of the *Sugya* 432 • Result of the Clarification 435

**Chapter 22: The *Nasi* and the Anointed Priest in the *Oleh v'Yored* Sacrifice (2:4–7; 8b–9a)** 437

The Repetition in Mishnayot 4–5 According to Our Version 440 • The Absence of the Legal Status of the Anointed Priest in Mishnayot 4–5 According to Our Version 442 • The Section “ור"ע מי פטר ליה מפר” and Its Difficulty 446 • The Difference Between the Mishna and the *Baraita* Regarding the Legal Status of the *Nasi* 451 • The Differences Between “Bava” 3 and “Bava” 4 in the *Baraita* 453 • The Relationship of “Bava” 4 to the Preceding “Bava”s 455 • On the Suggestion of the *Sugya* in the Babylonian Talmud 455 • Result of the Clarification 458

**Chapter 23: The Distinctions Between the Various High-Priestly Officials in Rabbinic Literature (3:4–6; 12a–b)** 460

On the Question of the Framework of the Paragraph “There Is no Difference Between ...” in Mishna Horayot 460 • On the Method of the Rishonim in Explaining the Final Section 462 • On the Meanings of “Serving Priest” and “Former Priest” 463 • On the Suggestion of the Mishna 467 • On the Source of the Halakhot “There Is no Difference Between ...” in Our Mishna 471 • Identification of the Tanna of the Mishna in the Babylonian *Sugya* and the Inherent Difficulties 476 • The Discussion of R. Meir and R. Yose Regarding the “Second” 478 • On the Suggestion of the Babylonian *Sugya* in Horayot and in Megila 480 • Result of the Clarification 482

**Chapter 24: On the Significance of “Many Garments” (Yerushalmi Horayot 3:3; 47c)** 484

Was None of the Anointing Oil Put Away or Was a Vial Stored? 485 • Is It True that “They Couldn't Make Another Anointing Oil to Anoint

Him"? 492 • Explanation of the Yerushalmi for “Many Garments” and Its Difficulty 498 • “Many Garments” Is a Temporary Replacement 499 • Result of the Clarification 504

**Chapter 25: On the Significance of “פר הבא על כל המצות”** 506  
(Horayot 3:3–4; 12a–b)

“פר הבא על כל המצות” – Is that the “Bull of the Anointed Priest” or the “Congregational Sacrifice for a Mistaken Ruling”? 506 • The First Paragraph in the Mishna – Is It Original? 520 • The Version of the *Baraita* in Yoma 73a and Its Method 522 • The Method of the Babylonian Talmud in the Issue of the Controversy Between R. Meir and the Sages 524 • On the Suggestion of the Babylonian *Sugya* 528 • Result of the Clarification 529

**Chapter 26: On the Legal Status of Many Garments of the Serving Priest and Many Garments of Former Priests** 531  
(Horayot 3:4; 12b)

The Relationship Between “Bava” 3 and the Other “Bava”s in the *Baraita* 532 • On the Opinion of the *Baraita* 533 • On the Source of “Bava” 3, and Its Influence on the Manuscript Version 535 • The Opinion of the *Baraita* in Tosefta Horayot and Its Version in the Tosefta and in the Babylonian Talmud 537 • Result of the Clarification 540

**Chapter 27: On the Significance of “and all remain for the time to come” (11b)** 541

Appendix (Instead of Footnote 6) 551

**Publications in which Chapters have Previously Appeared** 553